Editorial Commentary

Is It Ever Wise to Disregard Absolute Practice Guidelines?

Absolutely

Herbert L. Fred, MD, MACP

ottinor and colleagues¹ present the case of a 60-year-old woman in whom massive pulmonary embolism (PE) led to cardiac arrest with pulseless electrical activity. After her successful resuscitation, she was given systemic thrombolytic therapy and survived. Ordinarily, such management and outcome would not merit an editorial, because thrombolysis is the first-line treatment in patients with PE who present with cardiogenic shock or persistent arterial hypotension. However, the case in question wasn't ordinary. Eight weeks before her PE occurred, the patient had sustained a hemorrhagic cerebrovascular accident. That event took on added significance, because any history of hemorrhagic stroke or stroke of unknown origin is considered an absolute contraindication to thrombolytic therapy.

Faced with a critically ill patient at high risk for in-hospital death, Bottinor and associates carefully decided to disregard the aforementioned guideline and initiated systemic thrombolysis. Their decision not only proved to be life-saving, it illustrated a basic principle of good patient care: no practice guideline—therapeutic or otherwise, relative or absolute—should ever displace sound clinical judgment.

Several points about clinical practice guidelines deserve emphasis. First, guidelines can only summarize the best available evidence, which often is weak. In truth, guidelines are nothing more than roadmaps designed to lead us in the right direction; roadmaps, however, don't necessarily tell us the best path to take. Second, guidelines vary considerably in how they are developed and written, in whether they are derived primarily from expert opinion or objective evidence, and in how often they undergo revision as new evidence accumulates. Third, guidelines occasionally are marred by conflicts of interest and by clear-cut, sometimes intentional, bias. Fourth, guidelines increasingly serve as ammunition for the issuance of regulatory and insurance mandates. Fifth, guidelines tend to promote herd mentality. All too frequently, in fact, physicians view guidelines as items of dogma and follow them mindlessly. Fortunately for their patient, Bottinor and associates didn't do that.

References

- Bottinor W, Turlington J, Raza S, Roberts CS, Malhotra R, Jovin IS, Abbate A. Life-saving systemic thrombolysis in a patient with massive pulmonary embolism and a recent hemorrhagic cerebrovascular accident. Tex Heart Inst J 2014;41(2):175-7.
- Torbicki A, Perrier A, Konstantinides S, Agnelli G, Galie N, Pruszczyk P, et al. Guidelines on the diagnosis and management of acute pulmonary embolism: the Task Force for the Diagnosis and Management of Acute Pulmonary Embolism of the European Society of Cardiology (ESC). Eur Heart J 2008;29(18):2276-315.
- Meneveau N. Therapy for acute high-risk pulmonary embolism: thrombolytic therapy and embolectomy. Curr Opin Cardiol 2010;25(6):560-7.
- 4. Lee DH, Vielemeyer O. Analysis of overall level of evidence behind Infectious Diseases Society of America practice guidelines. Arch Intern Med 2011;171(1):18-22.
- Colwell J. Glutted with guidelines? Which ones to trust and how they can help you. ACP Hospitalist 2013;7(5):10-3. Available from: http://www.acphospitalist.org/archives/2013/05/coverstory. htm [cited 2013 Oct 24].
- 6. Fred HL. "Chronic" dishonesty in medicine? Tex Heart Inst J 2008;35(2):226.
- Attorney General's investigation reveals flawed Lyme disease guideline process, ISDA agrees to reassess guidelines, install independent arbiter [press release]. State of Connecticut Attorney General's Office; 2008 May 1. Available from: http://www.ct.gov/ag/cwp/view.asp?A=2795&Q=414284 [cited 2013 Oct 24].

Dr. Fred is an Associate Editor of the Texas Heart Institute Journal.

Address for reprints: Herbert L. Fred, MD, MACP, 8181 Fannin St., Suite 316, Houston, TX 77054

© 2014 by the Texas Heart® Institute, Houston

- Nathanson I. Guidelines and conflicts: a new twist. Chest 2013;144(4):1087-9.
- Neumann I, Akl EA, Valdes M, Bravo S, Araos S, Kairouz V, et al. Low anonymous voting compliance with the novel policy for managing conflicts of interest implemented in the 9th version of the American College of Chest Physicians antithrombotic guidelines. Chest 2013;144(4):1111-6.
- Waldman H. Agreement is reached on Lyme disease: shortterm treatment will undergo review [news article]. Hartford Courant; 2008 May 2:B1.
- 11. Jackson DW. Clinical guidelines: beware, what are suggestions will become mandates. Orthopedics Today 2010 March. Available from: http://www.healio.com/orthopedics/business-of-orthopedics/news/print/orthopedicstoday/%7B197c651b-381f-4fe6-9b18-5150ee2d46c6%7D/clinical-guidelines-beware-what-are-suggestions-will-becomemandates [cited 2013 Oct 29].
- 12. Jacobson PD. Transforming clinical practice guidelines into legislative mandates: proceed with abundant caution. JAMA 2008;299(2):208-10.
- 13. Fred HL. Elephant medicine revisited. Tex Heart Inst J 2008;35(4):385-7.